Notes on Plotinus - Ennead Four, Ninth Tractate - Are All Souls One?

4.9.1 Is Soul One, or Are All Souls Many?

The Soul of an Animal is One. We know this due to the fact that this Soul is present in its entirety at all points throughout said Animal's Body. The Soul does not manifest different parts of itself in the different parts and organs of the Body. For Animals that have Sensory Perceptions, the Sensitive phase of Soul is present to the entirety of their Bodies. For plants which live and grow, the phase of Soul responsible for a Vegetal life is present to the entirety of their Bodies. This fact raises an intriguing possibility. Are all Souls, including our own, One in this same way?

Why should we not count the Soul of the Universe as present in all of its residents? It is, after all, characteristically not divided among Bodies. Why should a Human Soul be One, but not the Soul of the Universe? A Human Soul is not some physical extension or Body, so why should we limit the Soul of the Universe in this way? If all Souls derive from the Soul of the Universe, and if the Soul of the Universe is One, then why wouldn't we admit that all Souls are One? Even if someone argues that our Soul and the Soul of the Universe derive from a single source, then this merely pushes the issue back a step until we are One again.

So, are all Souls One, or is a Soul only One when divided into a Body as a Particular Soul? After all, there are particularities that will arise if we hold that two people's Souls are One. Why don't both people share in each others Sensory Perceptions? Why doesn't one person's Moral Virtue apply to the other? Why don't they share in their appetites? Indeed, how does anything in the Universe escape the combined experiences of everything else in the Universe? How can the phases of Soul which are manifest vary so much from thing to thing and plant to animal? On the other hand, how do we Unify the Universe and explain the Principle of Soul if all Souls are not One?

4.9.2 What It Means to be One and Many

If the Souls of two people form One single Soul, then it does not necessarily follow that each of these component Souls are identical with their Principle of Unification. Thus, two manifestations of the same Principle needn't experience the same things. Two people can both equally be Human, yet one can be a Human at rest, and another a Human in motion. They both are fulfillments of the Potential for a Human Being, but they don't have to receive the same affections. We see a similar thing within a single Animated Body. Although the Sensitive phase of Soul is present to the entirety of the Body, something which affects the left hand is not felt in the right hand. For two Animals to experience the same affections, then it is insufficient for their Souls to be One. In order for two Animals to experience the same affections, it is their Body that would need to be One. Two Souls could only experience identical affections if they shared in the same affected Body. Indeed, the Universe as a whole is ignorant to the Sensory experiences of its constituents, and this fact is magnified by the immense volume of the Universe. Even some Animals, such as whales, are so large that they do not notice small injuries or movements.

From this, we can see that the Universe itself need not experience everything one of its constituents does. Of course, the Universe is Sympathetic to all of its constituents, and that all things on some level affect all things cannot be denied. Yet the mutual ability for the members of the Universe to affect one another does not imply that the Universe itself must experience all of the Sensations that its constituents do. The fact that all Souls are One equally does not imply that some of Soul's constituents are Virtuous, and others Vicious. Again, the Humanity that two people participate in need not experience their particular and relative states of rest or motion.

The Oneness of Soul is not meant to imply a complete lack of multiplicity. This total Oneness only truly belongs to the highest sphere. We say that Soul is Many because it is divided among Bodies, yet it is One as it part the of Indivisibility of its Intellectual Principle as well. Within One person, there is nothing which necessities that the whole be dominated by any of its parts. Yet on the contrary, something which affects the whole of a person will surely affect all of their parts. This holds true for the All, the Universe. The members of the Universe are all impacted by the affections of the Universe as a whole, yet it is less clear what implications the affections of the members of the Universe have on the whole.

4.9.3 Distribution of the Powers of Soul

Although it is unclear what affect we have on the Universe as a whole, the sympathetic affections amongst Human Beings are directly observable. We naturally empathize with suffering, sharing in it ourselves when we observe it in others. We have an innate desire to connect with and Love one another. Indeed, Love itself derives from this mutual sympathy that we are discussing.

Magic and spells which work to bring people together can cause such sympathetic affections over vast distances. The fact that two people may affect one another as such shows that the Human Soul is Unified. Further, the fact that words spoken softly (i.e. an incantation) can evoke a reaction in something far across space and time implies a Unity of All things in Soul.

Given this Unity of Soul, how is it possible that one Particular Soul will have the capacity for Reason, while another one will not? Why do some Particular Souls have many capabilities, while others are only able to grow (i.e. vegetation)? It is because there are multiple phases of Soul. Reason corresponds with the Indivisible phase of Soul, whereas the phases divided among bodies correspond with Sensations. This is because Soul experiences everything from each and every Particular perspective, evoking the appropriate Sensations in each place. There is also the power of the formation of Bodies and their growth (i.e. the vegetal phase of Soul). The fact that Soul has multiple powers and capabilities does not imply that it is not One. After all, a germinated seed has many latent powers, yet it is still One thing. This Multiplicity is subdivisions of a Unity, thus it is One and Many.

Why are all of Soul's latent powers not manifest in each place? Just like in an Individual Soul, while Universal Soul is One and the same everywhere, the Sensory and mental capabilities it manifests vary greatly from thing to thing. Some are given Sensation, others are given Reason, and others only possess the vegetal powers of growth and sustenance. Yet all of these distinctions dissolve upon the retreat of the Soul from the Body, and all of them are available to Universal Soul. Thus, all of these powers are said to derive from the Soul.

Why does the power of sustenance derive from Universal Soul, and not our Particular Soul? That the power of sustenance is present to every particular Soul (I.e. Universally) shows that it derives from Universal Soul. Because this power is Universally available, our Particular Soul has no need to generate it (i.e. Particular Souls only generate what they need and are missing). On the other hand, Sense Perceptions are unique to the experiencer, as are our Intellectual Judgements of said perspectives. Thus, these are generated on a particular basis.

4.9.4 Reconciliation of the Phases of Soul

The previous considerations should alleviate any bewilderment at the Unity of Particular Souls. Yet how can we show that all Souls are truly One? Is Soul One because all Souls derive from a single Soul, or do all Particular Souls form One Soul? If all Souls derive from a Single Soul, is this original Soul divided into

pieces, or does it remain whole? How could Soul beget multiple Particular Souls without being diminished by this process in some way?

Let Divinity be the witness that if there are to be Many there must first be One. Thus, Multiple Souls must arise from One Soul. If this primal Soul were a Body, multiplicity of Souls would have to occur in the form of division into distinct parts. If all of these parts were uniform, then every Particular Soul would be uniform in Quality, differing only in Quantity of Magnitude. Would such a Soul be One or Many? In fact, if the Essence of the Particular Soul were its Quantity of Magnitude, then Souls would be Many. On the other hand, if the Essence of the Particular Soul was the Form that it expresses as Quality, then in this case all Souls would be One. Thus, we can easily see how One Soul (in Form) can be Many (Quantities of Magnitude).

It is from this One Soul (in Form) that Many Souls derive. Each Particular Soul is like a copy of the original pattern of the One Soul. It is just as how a single wax seal can impress a pattern into many pieces of wax without itself being diminished. If the One Soul were a Body, it would be used up as it is divided into parts. Because instead it is incorporeal, there is nothing confusing about its image being replicated over and over again. This also alleviates any wonder about Soul having two phases, one being the original, incorporeal Essence, the other being its Manifestation in Bodies. Now we will discuss the consequences of this fact.

4.9.5 The Whole Potential and the Partial Actualization

How, then, will Soul be both One in Essence, but also Many? The only possibilities are for this Essence to be present in its entirety to each of the Many, or for this Essence to be the source of the Many while itself remaining whole and undiminished. In both cases, the Essence is singular. It is the whole to which the Particular members belong. This Essence expresses itself to these Particulars, but it does not lose anything of itself in this interaction. Though it can express itself to Many, it remains One. Its power is omnipotent and omnipresent, and so it is both everywhere and uniform in all places.

These facts should not astound us, as these mechanisms are not unique. The process that is science both produces every scientific inquiry, and is present in its entirety for every scientific inquiry. All plants start as a singular seed which goes on to produce a multitude of different Bodily parts. Yet each part that grows neither adds to nor subtracts from the whole of the plant. Each new plant that is begotten becomes a new whole, and yet each of these still will share in the singular Essence of this genus of plant. Such partitions are only Material, and could never affect the Unity of an Essence.

Some will object, and argue that one branch of scientific inquiry does not include the totality of all branches of scientific inquiry. This is of course true. The Actualization of the Potential for a particular branch of scientific inquiry is indeed distinct. Yet the Potential for scientific inquiry is itself still a unified whole. In a way, it can be helpful (in this context) to think of the whole as Potential, and the parts as partial Actualizations of this Potential. We must be careful, however, to note that each Actualization contains within in at least some part of all other Potential partial Actualizations. No partial Actualization is completely unique, otherwise there could be no thread of continuity to bind them all together under one unified whole of Potential. For example, the scientific process used in any genuine branch of scientific inquiry contains within it the Potential to develop all other branches of scientific inquiry. The most masterful scientific mind could develop all branches of scientific inquiry from the Essence of the scientific process. It is just how the master of Geometry can show a trail of proofs which demonstrate their theorems. Thus, with knowledge of the Essence of Geometry, such a master could reverse engineer the proof of any theorem, and derive any consequences which result from any theorem.

Our fallibility while embodied is the source of our confusions on these issues. Beyond the Body, these ruths are obvious, and the distinctions between all categories and individuals are clear.	